## The Russian Translation of "The Clockmaker"

## NICHOLAS G. ŽEKULIN

HE large number of editions which followed rapidly upon Joseph Howe's 1836 edition of Thomas Haliburton's The Clockmaker; or the Savings and Doings of Samuel Slick, of Slickville attest to the remarkable popularity of this singular work of colonial fiction. Within five years, three series of The Clockmaker had appeared on both sides of the Atlantic in a number of editions, a German translation was in the process of being published, and as a pendant to several Paris English language editions, a Frenchman, Philarète Chasles, had written an article in the foremost French journal of the day, Revue des Deux Mondes, on Sam Slick. These facts are, of course, well known.1 Certainly less well-known is the fact that Sam Slick's reputation reached as far as Russia. In its Nos. 2, 3 and 4 for 1855, the Russian journal Sovremennik (The Contemporary) published an anonymous translation of thirty-seven chapters from the first two series of The Clockmaker under the title Chasovshchik ili slova i dela Samiuelia Slikka, iz Slikkvillia. Ocherki amerikanskikh nravov Aliburtona ("The Clockmaker, or the Sayings and Doings of Samuel Slick of Slickville. Sketches of American Mores by Haliburton.")2

Sovremennik was founded by Alexander Pushkin in 1836. After his death in a duel only one year later, the journal existed in a somewhat moribund state in the hands of his friends and associates until it was taken over in 1847 by two poets, Nikolaĭ Nekrasov and Nikolaĭ Ogarev. Partly due to the initial presence of the fiery young critic, Vissarion Belinskiĭ, the journal became the mouthpiece of the realist revolt against romantic epigones and attracted to itself the majority of Russia's rising young authors. By 1855 Turgenev, Dostoevskiĭ, Goncharov and the

latest meteor, Tolstoĭ, had all appeared on the pages of the journal. Turgenev was and Tolstoĭ was becoming a mainstay of *Sovremennik*'s extensive stable of writers. The bent towards realism in literature was closely allied with a high degree of interest in the situation of the lower social orders and particularly in the emancipation of the serfs. Despite the ever watchful eye of the authorities, the thrust of *Sovremennik* became increasingly political and radical, particularly under the influence of the critics N.G. Chernyschevskiĭ (from 1853) and N.A. Dobroliubov (from 1856). This trend let to an eventual split with more moderate authors, such as Turgenev and Tolstoĭ.

It is widely assumed that the Russia of the mid-nineteenth century was culturally isolated from the rest of Western civilization, but this was not the case. For at least half a century Russians had been following closely the main trends and individuals in Western literature and science. A glance at the translations published in Sovremennik shows not only the great interest in Western literature, but also the ideological and sociopolitical bent of the journal. In the first decade of Nekrasov's and Panaev's control, the most frequently found translated authors in Sovremennik are Dickens, Thackeray and George Sand, Dickens in particular stands out, with translations of Dombey and Son (1847), David Copperfield (1851) and Sketches by Boz (1852) among others.3 The rivalry over Thackeray's Vanity Fair was so keen that Nekrasov virtually eliminated entire sections of the journal in order to get it out in Sovremennik before it appeared in the rival Otechestvennye zapiski ("Notes of the Fatherland")4

As might be expected, North American literature was less prominent than its older European counterparts. Nonetheless an interest in North America, particularly the United States, is to be seen. *Sovremennik* alone published articles such as "New York: Its hotels and offices" (1854, No. 11), "From America" by V.K. Bodisko (1856, Nos. 3, 4 and 6), "Congress in Washington in 1857" (1858, No. 4). In 1860 (Nos. 10 and 12) we find an article by M.L. Mikhaĭlov, "American Poets and Novelists," devoted to Hawthorne and Longfellow.

By this time a number of American authors had been translated into Russian. Fenimore Cooper was among the first and

probably the most popular. "The Spy" appeared in 1825, "The Pioneers" in 1828. In 1848 an article devoted specifically to Cooper, by A.V. Druzhinin, was published in *Sovremennik*, No. 7 and by 1865 his collected works had appeared in 25 volumes. Washington Irving (at least twelve tales from Tales of a Traveller appeared in several translations in 1825, along with some, including "Rip van Winkle" from The Sketchbook), E.A. Poe (e.g. "The Gold Bug" in 1847, "The Unparalleled Adventures of One Hans Pfaall" in 1853), H. Beecher Stowe ("Uncle Lot" in 1853, Uncle Tom's Cabin in 1857) were all known. Interest in Hawthorne seems to have begun in the early 1850's ("House of Seven Gables" Sovremennik, 1852, Nos. 9 and 10; "Rapaccini's Daughter," 1853, No. 10; The Scarlet Letter, 1856 Nos. 9 and 10). It is therefore in the context of this interest in North America, as is indicated by the sub-title, 6 that one must view Sovremennik's translation of Haliburton's sketches.

Anyone who has read *The Clockmaker* will realize the enormous difficulties facing a translator. A Russian translator would face the added and not inconsiderable problem of censorship. The years between 1848 and 1855 are known in Russian history as the "dark seven years" because of increasing censorship restrictions in the closing years of the reign of Nicholas I. Already in 1848 there were some thirteen different censorship agencies active in Russia.7 The impact of the censors is quite obvious in the translation of *The Clockmaker*.8 An examination of the chapters eliminated from the translation is indicative of the major areas with which the censorship was concerned. The increased rate of omission from the more didactic and less anecdotal second series clearly shows the hand of the censor. From the first series the chapters "Sayings and Doings in Cumberland," "The Dancing Master Abroad," "Setting up for Governor," where there is extensive discussion of politics, are omitted. "Father John O'Shaugnessy" with its account of sectarian strife, "The White Nigger" with its account of slavery (Russian serfs were not freed until 1861), "The Minister's Horn Mug" with its account of anarchy were also eliminated. At this time only two journals—the army journal Russkii Invalid and the patriotic Severnaia pchela ("The Northern Bee")—were permitted to publish any works, fiction or non-fiction, which referred to military action and therefore "A Tale of Bunker's Hill" is missing.9 "The Grahamite and the Irish Pilot," which touches on political, military, and religious issues, is also not to be found. All the references to Sam Slick's journey to Russian Poland with its indirect comment on czarist authoritarianism ("The Clockmaker's Opinion of Halifax") disappears10, as does the mention of arbitrary rule in the Russia of "Old Nick" in the chapter "Shampooing the British." Finally, the censor was worried about morality and so in "The Clockmaker's Opinion of Halifax" the description of the young lady whose frock has accidentally been torn off, leaving her "with all her riggin standin as far as her waist, and nothin left below but a short linen under garment" (1:96) becomes simply a statement of the fact that she was "standing in the sad realization of her loss; standing barely clutching the remains of her frock with her hands" (No. 2, 372) and the Major's reference to her "proper pretty leg" disappears, as indeed does his suggestion for entering the dining room in military formation. A little further on Sam Slick's vivid description of "little forced meat balls, of the size of sheep's dung" (1:97) becomes sanitized, in Russian, when the meat balls become the size of "nuts" (No. 2, 373). However, despite its potential prurient interest, Sam Slick's dream of embracing the freezing Katey Fairns in his bed, the central episode of the chapter "The Snow Wreath," is retained in its entirety.11

It is on the basis of these concerns that we can account for most of the various major omissions and changes within those chapters of *The Clockmaker* that appear in the Russian translation. In the chapter "The Preacher that Wandered from his Text" references to the minister swearing, to sinners quoting Scripture, to mob-rule and anarchy as well the insulting portrait of General Cuffy are omitted. Indeed the minister himself of the title becomes simply the "orator" and Mr. Everett's pastoral connections disappear except for the — presumably not understood — statement that Unitarians pay more than Uncle Sam (No. 2, 341). Similarly Solomon becomes an anonymous ancient sage (No. 2, 341), the Italian Madonnas that Slick buys become "female portraits" (No. 3, 184), and the deposed Mr. Hopewell

("The Confessions of a Deposed Minister") becomes simply an "old" minister (No. 4, 327) with all the discussion of sectarianism and the nature of freedom dropped. On the political side, in the chapter "Conversations at River Philip" all trace of the conversation between the Irishman and the Judge Beler, whom he addresses as "your Lordship" and who rejects the titles on the grounds that "There are no Lords here, ... we are all free" (1:26) disappears. A curious transmogrification occurs in the same chapter. The royal King William IV becomes Cicero, whose oratorial powers are claimed to be inferior to those of the commoner Daniel Webster. However Cicero's own contemporary, Julius Caesar, as an assassinated political leader, disappears altogether ("Finding the Mare's Nest"). Discussion of the War of 1812 ("A Cure for Conceit") is omitted and the Muscovy drake of "The Clockmaker's Parting Advice" becomes a mere "drake." None of the infrequent "D - n"s and other swear words appear in the Russian, though whether because the translator did not know the abbreviations or the censor intervened cannot be known.

The censor does seem on occasion to have nodded. The dread word "revolution" escapes in "Sister Sall's Courtship," though without its adjective "glorious" (No. 2, 397; 1:162). The word "slave" is possible where a discussion of slavery is not. A passing reference to blacks' butchering whites ("Cumberland Oysters") (No. 2, p. 360) also survives, although this is perhaps because it earns Slick's opprobrium. Indeed political discussions where the excesses resulting from democracy are pointed to (e.g. "A Body Without a Head" 1:254; No. 3, 117) or where the squire justifies his books on the grounds of patriotism (2:369; No. 4, 386) seem to have received the censor's approval.

Finally it might be said that even in the short time over which *The Clockmaker* was published, a loosening of censorship following the death of Nicholas I (who died in February 1855, some two weeks after the appearance of No. 2) can perhaps be detected. While references to lynching are carefully omitted in the first set of chapters (e.g. 1:29; 1:75), already in No. 3 in the chapter "Travelling in America" it appears as "execution with judgement" (No. 3, 140). Similarly, although discussions of slav-

ery are omitted, including the chapter entitled "Slavery" which would have been included in No. 3, in the Chapter "The Wrong Room" the description of the Fourth of July as "a splendid spectacle; fifteen millions of free men and three million of slaves a celebratin' the birthday of liberty; rejoicin' in their strength, their freedom and enlightenment" (2: 321-22) is retained in its entirety.

The language of *The Clockmaker* presents formidable problems for a foreigner attempting to effect a translation. The Russian translator, while demonstrating perhaps surprising ingenuity, is occasionally misled or bewildered by Sam Slick's dialect. He certainly makes no attempt to reproduce any kind of dialect for Sam in the Russian translation, nor does he attempt to distinguish the accents of the negro slaves, the Dutchman, Mr. Zwicker, - beyond the use of a "Goten Hymel"-("The Wrong Room"), The Queen of the Sandwich Isles ("Shampooing the English") or the German lady ("Travelling in America"), even though precisely the same kind of consonantal manipulation was commonly used in Russian at this time to portray a Russian-speaking German. Sam's own attempts at speaking French and Italian ("Cumberland Oysters," "Italian Painting") are preserved verbatim, in roman script, as are the various Latin aphorisms dotted through the text. The one Greek motto ("The Blowin' Time") is actually rendered in Greek characters (No. 3, 95, cf. 1:194). The pomposity of diplomatic jargon ("Shampooing the English" 2:181-82), on the other hand, is equally pompously rendered in Russian (No. 4, 320-21).

The translator seems to have used a good ear and a certain acumen. Such phenomena as the dropped "g" from Sam's "-ing" the use of "puss" for "purse" or even "Mount-sheer" for "Monsieur" cause him few problems of comprehension. He bravely translates all the state nicknames ("hoosiers, buckeys" etc., "The Schoolmaster Abroad," No. 3, 358), has no difficulty with the different types of fisheries available to Nova Scotia in the same chapter, but studiously omits Sam's several shipping comparisons (e.g. in "Sister Sall's Courtship" or "Shampooing the English"). Occasionally he makes a good guess, but when the sound is too far removed from "standard" English or when the

language is too "American," he simply omits the offending section. Sam's eulogy:

"But what a country this Bay country is, isn't it? Look at that medder; bean't it lovely? The Prayer Eyes of Illanoy are the top of the ladder with us, but these dykes take the shine off them by a long chalk, that's sartin. The Land in our far west, it is generally allowed, can't be no better; ("Windsor and the Far West" 1:292)

produces one guess (at "medder") and a wholesale elimination of the next sentence:

All in all, what a land it is around the shores of this bay! Look, is it not true, that it is a beautiful place? Everybody agrees, that there is no country on earth better than that which lies to the West of us. (No. 3, 132)

The translator is similarly defeated by Sam's comment on the American autumn and then omits the subsequent comparison: "Where will you ditto our fall? It whips English weather by a long chalk, none of your hangin', shootin', drownin', throatcuttin' weather, but a clear sky and a good breeze, rael cheerfulsome." (2:3). He follows Sam's description of his Kentucky rifle: "there's no mistake in a rail right down genuwine good Kentuck" (2:365), translating it as "having put your trust in a real. native Kentuck, you'll never make a mistake, I assure you" (No. 4, 383), but guesses incorrectly that "wrinkle" refers to the rifle itself and not to Sam's advice on how to aim it in "that wrinkle is worth having." On the other hand his translations of "Pat Moran's cow" ("Justice Pettifog" 1:3) as a "plague-stricken cow" and "unhansum lookin" in a description of Mrs. Porter ("Taming a Shrew" 1:220) as "ugly old crow" (No. 3, 107) show a greater felicity. In one or two instances, where the translator does not understand a word, but seems to feel that it is too concrete and central to be missed out, he resorts to the expediency of transliteration, no doubt leaving his readers to do the guessing for him. Thus Sam's proposed "towers" (tours) become "tover,"12 church "meetings" become "miting" and "shampoo" — fortunately eventually explained to the squire in the chapter "Shampooing the English" — is transliterated as "shampu."

After his dialect probably the most striking feature of Sam Slick's language is his use of puns. In most instances these are

either impossible for, or incomprehensible to the translator. He makes no effort even at the simple expedient of translating the frequent puns on names, such as Justice Doolittle, Constable Nabb, Gobble the gluttonous diplomat, Allspice the nutmeg swindler, but simply transliterates even them. However in the chapter "Talking Latin," where the main emphasis of the conversation between Mrs. Green and Sam is based on his deliberate misunderstanding through puns of what she says, the translator is very successful in doing the same in Russian. He is helped considerably by the fact that the Latin / latten pun is paralleled in Russian as "latyn' / latun" and by substituting for Arabella's five quarters of schooling a simple Russian pun on her coming out on top of her class and being taken out of the school ahead of anyone else (No. 3, 152). On the other hand, perhaps to make up for the many puns that he has to omit, the translator introduces one of his own in the chapter "Justice Pettifog." Here he frequently uses the abstract noun "justice" for the legal title of Mr. Pettifog, thus increasing the irony by attributing the Justice's decrees to justice itself.

On a number of occasions, the translator simply makes mistakes. "Sleighing" becomes "skating" ("The Blowin' Time"), "Old Johnny Farquar, the English help" ("The Snow Wreath") changes sex, perhaps out of confusion with "Jenny," people who must move "back of Canada" ("The American Eagle") must move simply "to Canada" and on one occasion "brandy" briefly becomes "rum" ("The Schoolmaster Abroad"). Sam Slick's typical assertion, in introducing the opinion of one Doctor Rush, that "it is generally allowed our doctors take the shine off of all the world" ("A Cure for Conceit" 1:90) emerges as an assertion that "in the opinion of our doctors, he [Dr. Rush] may well be the best doctor in the world" (No. 3, 92). The translator occasionally exercises editorial license in abbreviating some of Sam's tautologies. Mr. Bobbin's mercantile diatribe against "a corrupt, a lignious and lapidinous aristocracy" ("Talking Latin"), while presenting no problems as regards the adjectives, suffers certain modifications and curtailments:

<sup>&</sup>quot;... put them into a parcel, envelope 'em with a panoply of paper, tie them up and put them into the scales, and they will be found wantin'.

There is not a pound of honesty among 'em, nay not an ounce, nay not a pennyweight. The article is wanting — it is not in their catalogue. The word never occurs either in their order, or in their invoice. They won't bear the inspection,—they are not marchantable,—nothin' but refuse." (2:119)

## becomes

"... wrap this aristocracy in paper, cover it with daubed crests, tie it up with liveried lace, throw it on the scales, and you will see it will not raise the other dish. You will not find a pound of honesty, not even an ounce, not even a zolotnik [tiny weight]. This country lacks something, but whatever it is—you will not find it in the catalogue of aristocractic qualities. (No. 3, 149)

Strangely, the translator offers his readers little assistance. There are only five explanatory footnotes. Two explain Haliburton's puns (on John Bull and on the dangers of banks). Two offer the factual information that teak is a wood from the East Indies and that there are customarily twelve people on a jury. Only the fact that "Blue-nose" is Sam Slick's term for Nova Scotians (No. 2, 309) can be considered of any importance.<sup>13</sup>

Despite the obvious deficencies in the translation, <sup>14</sup> the Russian *Clockmaker* is still enjoyable to read and would have given contemporary Russians an unusual and interesting insight into "American mores."

The absence of any studies by Haliburton scholars into the textual differences between the various editions makes it very difficult even to guess at the edition used by the Russian translator. The fact that only two series were translated (numbered through in the Russian) and that the chapters published in No. 4 are preceded by the word "conclusion" suggest that an edition with only the first two series was used. This might indicate one of the Paris editions, either that of Galignani or one of those in Baudry's European Library. 15 Further credence to such a supposition may be lent by Russia's ties with France which were much closer than those with Britain. It is in fact not inconceivable that Philarète Chasles's article on Sam Slick, republished in 1851 in his book Etudes sur la Littérature et les Moeurs des Anglo-Américains au XIX siècle, might have led a Russian to search out an edition of this curious book—and might in turn have influenced the choice of sub-title in the Russian translation. "Sketches of American Mores by Haliburton."

It cannot be said that *The Clockmaker* made a great impact on Russian life and letters. No mention of it is to be found in Nekrasov's extant editorial correspondence, or in the letters and diaries of such close collaborators of Sovremennik as Turgenev or Tolstoĭ. Indeed Sam Slick and his creator appear to have slipped from Russian consciousness until recent times. In 1961 N.I. Samokhvalov published, in a provincial press in Krasnodar, a book entitled Vozniknovenie kriticheskogo realizma v literature SShA, 1830-1885 ("The Development of Critical Realism in the Literature of the USA, 1830-1885") in which the opening chapter, entitled "The Humour of New England," is devoted to Seba Smith and Thomas Haliburton. These same two authors are similarly featured in Samokhvalov's standard college textbook on American Literature (Amerikanskaia literatura XIX v.: Ocherk razvitiia kriticheskogo realizma. [Moscow: Vysshaia shkola, 1964] "American Literature of the XIXth C.: A Study of the Development of Critical Realism"). Neither Samokhvalov nor the Kratkaia literaturnaia entsyklopediia ("Short Literary Encyclopedia"), which in volume 8 (1975) has a short article on Haliburton, seems aware of Sovremennik's 1855 translation of this author's masterpiece, undoubtedly the first piece of Canadian fiction to be translated into Russian.<sup>16</sup>

## NOTES

- See, for example, A.H. O'Brien, *Haliburton ("Sam Slick"): A Sketch and Bibliography*, Rpt. from Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada (Montreal: Gazette, 1909).
- <sup>2</sup>Sovremennik, 1855, XLIX, 2 (Feb., No. 2), [Slovesnost'] 307-402 (Chaps. 1-XVII); L (March, No. 3), [Slovesnost'] 89-187 (Chaps. XVIII-XXX, but no chap. XXVIII); L, 2 (April, No. 4), [Slovesnost'] 319-92 (Chaps. XXXI-XXXVIII). Future refs. will be to number and page. Acknowledgement and thanks are due to my student, Elaine Trimble, whose research paper on translations published in Sovremennik in the late 1840's and early 1850's brought the existence of a Clockmaker translation to light.
- <sup>3</sup>Many other journals were also translating Dickens and most of his works including his "American Notes" were quickly translated into Russian, often within a year of their English publication. See Charles Dickens. Bibliografiia russikh perevodov i kriticheskoi literatury na russkom iazyke 1838-1960, (Moscow: Vsesoiuz. knizh. palata, 1962).
- 'See Nekrasov's letter of August 2, 1850 to A.L. Krylov in N.A. Nekrasov, Sobranie sochinenii, VIII (Moscow: Khud.Lit., 1967), 96-97.

- <sup>5</sup>See V.A. Libman. Amerikanskaia literatura v russkikh perevodakh i kritike. Bibliografiia 1776-1975 (Moscow, Nauka, 1977).
- <sup>6</sup>It was, of course common to use "American" in the sense of "North American." Haliburton does so himself on a number of occasions in *The Clockmaker*: see e.g. T.C. Haliburton, The Clockmaker or The Sayings and Doings of Samuel Slick of Slickville (First Series : Fifth Edition, London : Bentley, 1839. Second Series: London: Bentley, 1838), Second series, pp. 341 and 371. All future references are to this edition, the series being indicated by an arabic numeral.
- A.V. Nikitenko, Zapiski i dnevnik (1826 1877), I (St.Pbg: 1893), 518-19.
- <sup>8</sup>It is, of course, impossible—and irrelevant—to determine what was omitted by the translator or editor in anticipation of censorship problems and what was "blue-pencilled" by the actual censor, or censors. The censor for Sovremennik at this time was V.N. Beketov, but there was frequent interference from higher censorship bodies in the affairs of a journal.
- This ban was shortly to be lifted and the maiden military piece in Sovremennik was Tolstoi's "Sebastopol in December" which appeared in 1855, No. 6.
- <sup>10</sup>The passing reference to this Polish visit in "Travelling in America" remains.
- "The chapters omitted from the second series are "The Voluntary System,"
  "Training a Cariboo," "Nick Bradshaw," "Elective Councils," "Slavery,"
  "Putting a Foot in it," "English Aristocracy and Yankee Mobocracy" and "Canadian Politics." Most of these have a heavy political content except "The Voluntary System" which deals primarily with Church matters. The penultimate chapter "Keeping up steam" is also omitted as a chapter. though the long opening paragraph appears as the opening paragraph to the last chapter.
- <sup>12</sup>The translator is confused by the fact that Sam uses "tower" both as an edifice. e.g. the Tower of London, ("Finding a Mare's Nest") and as a tour, e.g. "a tower to Europe" ("The Clockmaker's Parting Advice") and so uses the non-existent "tover" for both. Yet curiously he guessed correctly at "tour" in "Travelling in America" where Sam's "first tower in the Clock-trade was up Canada way" (2:71) becomes "my first experience in clock trading took place in Canada" (No. 3, 142).
- <sup>13</sup>Of the various words in Russian for blue, the translator chooses "sizvi."a blue-grey.
- <sup>14</sup>There are some grounds for thinking that the translator became more proficient in understanding Haliburton's language as he progressed through the work. Thus "Old Nick" ("The Road to a Woman's Heart" 1:69) is simply translated—incomprehensibly to a Russian—whereas Mr. Zwicker's "Old Saydon" ("The Wrong Room" 2:326) is identified and translated as the devil.
- <sup>15</sup>See O'Brien, nos. 27, 28, 30, p. 12. The 1839 edition in Baudry's European Library was published anonymously, though already in his 1841 article in Revue des Deux Mondes (XXVI, April 1st, p. 307) Chasles identifies the author as Haliburton. He incidentally suggests (p. 307) that the philological problems are easily surmountable and, more interestingly, draws a comparison between the huge, growing nations to whom the future belongs—the United States and Russia—and suggests that Europe would do well to learn as much as possible about them, for example by reading books such as The Clockmaker (pp. 309 and 325).

<sup>16</sup>Although it has not been possible to establish the identity of the translator, two pieces of circumstantial information which may be of use in any future attempts to solve the puzzle of how The Clockmaker appeared in Sovremennik are worth mentioning. The minor author G.P. Danilevskii, who published Russian translations of Shakespeare and who was known for his enthusiasm for North America, uses the term "white nigger" in his novel Beglyev Novorossii (Runaways in Novorossiya, 1862)). This is, of course, the title of one of the chapters of The Clockmaker omitted from the Sovremennik translation. Although this slang term was not invented by Haliburton, it does not appear to have had very wide circulation and is to be found in only a few dictionaries of American English (see e.g. M. Mathews, ed., A Dictionary of Americanisms. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1951). Between 1849 and 1859 Danilevski published a number of stories and articles in Sovremennik under his own name, pseudonymously and anonymously.

Among the materials in a recent donation to the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris (N.a.f. 16275) is a letter to Ivan Turgenev from Philarète Chasles, a previously unknown correspondent of his. Dated 29 May 1863, the letter thanks Turgenev for a copy of his latest novel (the novel On the Eve appeared in a separate French edition in 1863) and thus testifies to a personal contact between Chasles and Turgenev by the early 1860s and suggests that Turgenev in turn may have been acquainted with Chasles's

work.