

structure are less compelling, largely because of a limiting conception of "career."

Diverging Pathways will become a "must read" for anyone interested in the issue of ability groupings within schools, and the impact of such groupings on academic achievement. Furthermore, the findings pertaining to the convergence (e.g., equalization) impact that the British post-secondary system has on occupational achievement will be of interest to those who are interested in the structure of post-secondary education. The argument for career deflections based on these groupings is much weaker, and as such the book does not have much to offer the field of career development. A more appropriate subtitle may have been "Social structure and educational deflections."

Kris Magnusson
University of Calgary

Bruno-Jofre, R. del C. (Ed.) (1993). *Issues in the history of education in Manitoba: From the construction of the common school to the politics of voice*. New York: Edwin Mellen Press. pp. 653, (hardcover). \$109.95.

This collection of essays, edited by Rosa del Carmen Bruno-Jofre of the University of Winnipeg, is characteristic of two trends in the *new* educational history: the Annales-influenced construction of microhistories and the post-modernist concern with "other voices." These essays represent the diversity and scope of current approaches to the history of education in Canada as well as some of the critical issues pertaining to method and theory in the field. The book consists of sixteen chapters organized into seven themes which reflect concerns of the new educational history with ethnicity, class, gender, and religion. In his lengthy introduction, Osborne informs us that the collection does not "represent a comprehensive picture of the history of education in Manitoba" but rather a "series of snapshots of particular elements of that history" (pp. 1-2). The reader is warned also that the new approaches represented make it "increasingly difficult to move from the micro to the macro level of historical writing" (p. 3).

Part I, "The Public Construct of the Common School" contains the strongest contributions in the collection. Tim Mitchell's "Forging a New Protestant Ontario on the Agricultural Frontier" uses an impressive array of primary and secondary sources to examine how localized factors in Brandon led to the Manitoba School Question. Similarly, Richard Henley's "The School Question Continued" looks at the long term consequences of introducing restrictive language legislation in the province of Manitoba. His observation that "school systems are a product of their own history" (p. 68) is central to a conceptual understanding of education as a multi-layered social process. These two studies appear to contradict strongly the problem of reconciling macro- and micro-levels of power posed by Osborne in his introduction.

Part II, "Opening Pedagogical Spaces," expands our understanding of education beyond that of the formal system. "To Rouse the Workers from Apathy and Indifference" by Tom Mitchell and Rosa del Carmen Bruno-Jofre examines the manner in which organized workers, political organizations, and middle class reformers were "instrumental in shaping the political views and consciousness of workers" (p. 101). What is missing in this contribution is further illumination of the insider response of representatives of the working class. Gerhard Ens's "Mennonites and Modernism" points to factors outside of the immediate context of Manitoba and the Manitoba School Question which lead to conflicts within the Mennonite community over traditional and revisionist interpretations of education. Ens's study employs historical and ethnographic perspectives to emphasize that cultural hegemonic factors form only one of many different kinds of constraints which impinge upon the values and beliefs which surround educational practice.

Parts III and IV of the text deal with "Teacher Education in Manitoba" and "Teacher Organizations." "Teacher Education in Manitoba 1945-1982" by Alexander Gregor is a primarily descriptive account which traces how chronic problems of short supply and inadequate preparation during World War I were alleviated finally in the 1970s. Ironically, it is this period in which the decision was made to provide an integrated program of teacher training in universities. Different constructions of what constitutes academic standards and professionalism and the inherent tension between these two domains form the basis of Gregor's thorough treatment. Mitchell's "We Must Stand Fast for the Sake of our Profession," describes

how teachers in western Canada were able to form unions only after World War I. Although Rosa Bruno-Jofre suggests in "The Manitoba Teachers Federation 1919-1933" that the issues of salaries and community status "were intrinsically related to the question of power at micro and macro-level" (p. 340), it remains less clear as to how this fundamental conceptual problem is addressed precisely in her study.

One of the more disappointing sections in the book is Part V. "Formal Education and the Aboriginal People" which attempts to give voice to aboriginal educational experiences in Manitoba. The use of the singular Aboriginal 'people' seems to obscure the realities of the diversity of First Nations peoples in Manitoba. Brian Titley's "Industrial Education for Manitoba Natives" uses the example of the Rupert's Land Industrial school to typify the failure of industrial schooling in equipping native students for employment. This article fails to contextualize historically critical educational objectives such as "civilization" which, despite Titley's claim, did not equate with more contemporary notions of assimilation or acculturation. Deo Poonwassie's "Higher Education for Native Students in Manitoba Universities" is a polemic which calls for a "commitment to equity as an official policy" (p. 424) in Manitoba universities. Poonwassie presents a strong case for the educational disparities which native peoples have experienced in the Canadian context. At the same time, his essay highlights the possibility that educational institutions may be the guardians of social justice as much as agents of discriminatory social control. It is also apparent that there is a need to expand and conceptually refine this area of Canadian educational history through individual micro-studies of native communities and the internal factors which have facilitated or impeded educational development over the last 100 years. The pervasive theme of failure which surrounds so much of the literature on native education certainly requires reexamination. This section would have been greatly strengthened with contributions documenting other more positive educational experiences, case studies of band-run schools, as well as traditional methods of education.

The topics of Parts VI and VII are 'Women' and 'Memoirs' (of teachers), respectively. "The Making of a Teacher 1919-1925" and "Teaching as Growth 1935-1976" both by Sybil Shack are life history accounts of one teacher in the history of education in Manitoba. Although the inclusion of personalized accounts is of interest, it is unclear as to

precisely how representative Shack's experiences were or how they connect with the other contributions in this collection. In contrast, "The Oblate Sisters, a Manitoba Order" by Rosa del Carmen Bruno-Jofre draws on extensive archival sources including diaries, letters, and oral testimonials to trace the birth of the order "within the context of the Manitoba School Question" (p. 554). In a work which is highly reminiscent of Marta Danylewycz's study of convent life in Quebec, Bruno-Jofre explores the relationship between members of the Order and the Archbishop Langevin following the Laurier-Greenway compromise of 1896. This study of the convent community from an inner perspective effectively reverses "top-down" or "event-oriented" treatments of the Manitoba School Crisis traditionally constructed in a patriarchal image.

Taken as a whole, *Issues in the History of Education in Manitoba* is a fragmented collection of essays which lacks a central theme. If you throw anything into a pot, it does not guarantee a good stew. The lack of overall continuity and the detachment of the introduction from the body of essays detracts from the strong contributions contained in this collection. There are notable omissions including the relationship between schooling and family life and childhood, the culture of the classroom, and the development of curricula which might be included in a future study. This collection ideally should have been divided into two or three separate publications each one dealing with a series of themes perhaps chronologically arranged to suggest some connections between aspects of the social history of education in Manitoba. The central strength of this collection is that it does attest to the overall complexity and diversity of educational history in Manitoba and elsewhere. At a prohibitive price of \$109.95, this collection of essays will sit primarily on library shelves in universities or colleges as an informative resource for selective usage.

Elizabeth Churchill
Calgary